1991 APR 18 PM 3: 38

SCOTE CLES

SUPERIOR COURT. FOR THE STATE OF WASHINGTON COUNTY OF KING

DONALD L. BARNETT,

NO. 88-2-04148-2

Plaintiff.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

v.

JACK A. HICKS, JACK H. DuBOIS,)
and E. SCOTT HARTLEY,)
individually and as the Board)
of Directors of COMMUNITY)
CHAPEL AND BIBLE TRAINING)
CENTER and COMMUNITY CHAPEL AND)
BIBLE TRAINING CENTER,)

Defendants.

11

ł

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

13

14

15 16

17

18

19

20 21

22

23 24

25

26

This matter, having come on regularly upon an Order of Reference to Private Arbitration dated January 23, 1991, and the undersigned having heard the witnesses' testimony, examined the Exhibits, heard arguments of Counsel and having delivered an Oral Memorandum of Opinion on February 6, 1991, now makes and enters the following written Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law.

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Defendant Community Chapel and Bible Training Center ("Community Chapel" or "Church") was organized and incorporated in 1967 by Plaintiff Donald Lee Barnett ("Pastor Barnett"), Lyle L. Bullinger, Everett Scott Hartley Jr. and Keith Eugene Gunn, as more particularly appears from Exhibit 1, the 1967 Articles of Incorporation.

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

212 Watermark Tower 1109 First Avenue Scottle, Weshington 98101 (206) 467-0993

FINDINGS OF FACT AND 1 109 F
Scottle, Wa
(200)

- 2. Community Chapel is a non-profit corporation and religious organization. According to its Articles of Incorporation ("Articles") and its Articles of Faith and Bylaws ("Bylaws"), it was founded to promote certain Christian principles. Community Chapel is a congregational, not a hierarchal, church.
- 3. From the beginning, and continuing through 1987, the Articles and Bylaws provided that the Original Pastor, Donald Lee Barnett, would have certain power and control over the corporate body; that he hold office as Original Pastor; President of the Corporation; ex officio member of the Board of Directors (Board of Senior Elders) for as long as he lived, and that he could not be removed from such offices.
- 4. Virtually no significant action could be taken by any Board, Officer, or official of the corporation without the concurrence and approval of Donald Lee Barnett.
- 5. Numerous provisions of the Articles and Bylaws of the Corporation, set out guarantees that Donald Lee Barnett could not be removed and that he had the power to prevent any action being taken or any changes being made to the corporate structure, except with his concurrence and approval. (Exhibits 1 through 10).
- 6. The Bylaws in existence as of March 3, 1988 (Exhibit 10) reflect the position of Pastor Barnett as the original pastor in at least the following ways:

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

212 Watermark Tower 1109 First Avenue Seattle, Washington 98101 (206) 467-0393

- b. Page 4, Section IV, Article 2(b): "The original chairman of the board of senior elders is Donald Lee Barnett who cannot be removed from office while living."
- c. Page 5, Article 3: "Additional members of the board of senior elders may be appointed by the board of senior elders from among the elders of the corporation church by the affirmative vote of the pastor and at least all other board of senior elders, save one."
- d. Page 5, Article 5 provides for removal of members of the board of senior elders, with the proviso that, "the original pastor shall not be subject to removal from the position of chairman of the board of senior elders."
- e. Page 6, Article 6, Paragraph I: The powers of the board of senior elders include "exercising jurisdiction in any additional matter which the board of senior elders feels responsible subject to the concurrence of the original chairman of the board of senior elders if he is still presiding."
- f. Page 6, Article 7: "The article applies only if the pastor of the corporation church and the chairman of the

P. - -

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 3

1

2

3

5

6

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

212 Watermark Tower 1109 First Avenue Seattle, Washington 98101 (206) 467-0393 board of senior elders are one and the same person: The board of senior elders shall not meet to discuss problems or make decisions without the presence or permission of the chairman and a minimum of all members of the board of senior elders save one, except to consider the chairman's salary . . . This regulation shall apply even if the chairman is on extended leave. In such cases, action without him can only be made if reasonable effort to contact him fails and if it is judged to be an emergency by all present. Even so, the board shall not make any decisions contrary to what it believes the chairman's decision would be, if the case is such as to require his concurrence. . . "

- g. Page 7, Article 11: "The board of senior elders shall have no power to infringe upon the pastoral rights and authority listed in these bylaws."
- h. Page 7, Section IV, Article 2: "The original president of the corporation is Donald Lee Barnett, who cannot be removed from office while living."
- i. Page 7, Section V, Article 3: "The board of senior elders shall have the power to overturn decisions made by the president of the corporation, except the original president of the corporation, regarding his decisions about interpretation of these bylaws and areas not covered by these bylaws."
- j. Page 7, Section V, Article 5: "Removal of the president of the corporation: except for the original president of the corporation, the president of the corporation may be

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

- k. Page 13, Section IX, Article 1: "A minimum of three-fourths (3/4) majority affirmative vote of the board of senior elders and the original pastor's concurrence, if still presiding, is necessary to amend the bylaws stated in this document."
- l. Page 14, Article 2: "In case of any disagreement of interpretation of these rules (in the event an agreement cannot be reached), a decision of the board of senior elders takes precedence over the division heads and/or the deacon board. If the disagreement cannot be reconciled by a two-thirds (2/3) majority vote of the board of senior elders, the pastor shall decide the issue."
- m. Page 16, Section I, Article 1, Paragraph A: The original pastor is Donald Lee Barnett. "The pastor shall be recognized as the spiritual overseer of the church, ordained and appointed by God for the ministry and to shepherd the flock of Community Chapel and Bible Training Center. In this capacity, he shall be the chief elder and chairman of the board of senior elders."
- n. Page 17, Paragraph B(2): "The original pastor, having established the original church by the direction of God and with support of the congregation, shall have oversight of the same until the pastor agrees to change. . . . " Future pastors

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

- O. Page 30, Section VII, Article 1, Paragraph A(4):
 "The ordination of the pastor shall be in effect until he is
 removed from the position of pastor (with the exception of the
 original pastor, who cannot be removed from office while living),
 until he resigns, or until this church no longer exists."
- 7. The foregoing provisions are hereinafter referred to as the "Protective Provisions."
- 8. The Board of Senior Elders, also known as the Board of Directors, were charged with the management of the affairs of the corporation (Exhibit 3, page 2) and their powers and duties were as prescribed by the Bylaws (Exhibit 3, page 3).
- 9. The Bylaws, in effect during the year 1987 through March 4, 1988, are as set out in Exhibit 10:
- a. Division I, Sec. II, Art. One, provides in part: "The total Corporation (Community Chapel and Bible Center) shall be controlled by a Board of Directors hereinafter called "The Board of Senior Elders."
- b. Division I, Sec. III, provides in part: "This corporation shall have no members. All decision-making authority for this corporation shall be vested in the Board of Senior Elders (Board of Directors) and the Board of Deacons as defined in these Bylaws." Division I, Sec. IV., Art. One, provides in part: "The Board of Senior Elders shall consist of not less than

112 ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 6

212 Watermark Tower 1109 Flost Avenue rattle, Washington 98101 (206) 467-0393

26

three members, which shall govern Community Chapel and Bible Training Center in all areas, as defined in these Bylaws, except in areas reserved for the Pastor of the Corporation Church alone, and in accordance with the following rules:"

- c. Division I, Section N, Art. Six, provides in part:
 "The Board of Senior Elders shall direct the Corporation in such
 matters as:
 - (D) Settling disputes within the Corporation that cannot be handled by delegated authority.
 - (I) Exercising jurisdiction in any additional matters for which the Board of Senior Elders feels responsible (subject to the concurrence of the original Chairman of the Board of Senior Elders if he is still presiding)."
- Community Chapel had 10. several different offices as of 1987. The Board of Senior Elders was composed of three members, E. Scott Hartley, Jack Hicks and Jack DuBois. In addition to these members, Pastor Barnett was an ex-officio member and Chairman of the Board, in accordance with the Bylaws. Operating under the Board of Senior Elders was the Board of Elders, composed of 14 individuals. The powers of the Board of Elders are set forth in Div. III, Sec. II, Article 1 of the Bylaws and include, with the pastor's concurrence, teaching Bible classes, preaching, baptizing, performing marriages, counselling, and "perform other functions or ministries for which there is need."
- 11. Community Chapel flourished from its beginning of some 37 congregants to over 3,500; it established satellite churches

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

113

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 7

212 Watermark Tower 1109 First Avenus Searth, Washington 98101 (206) 467-0393

- 12. Community Chapel was located on two separate but adjacent parcels of land, the East and West Campuses. The East Campus is the church's original location and consists of a 600 seat chapel, administrative offices, religious bookstore and gift shop, Bible College classrooms and library, printing shop, recording studio, and parking lot.
- 13. The West Campus was purchased and custom built to suit Community Chapel's needs in 1980. The West Campus has a 2,000 seat chapel, and Education Building for its K-12 school, a large gymnasium, a large parking lot, and an apartment building to house Bible College students.
- 14. The church parsonage was located approximately one mile from Community Chapel's East and West Campuses. The parsonage had been designed by Pastor Barnett and built primarily through labor donated by Community Chapel parishioners. It was both Pastor Barnett's home and pastoral office. Pastor Barnett did not have an office at Community Chapel's East and West Campuses, but did have a direct telephone link to the campuses.
- 15. Community Chapel's growth and prosperity continued until the year 1987 when a number of unsettling events occurred:
- a. Rumors and complaints from women to the Elders involving Donald Barnett's sexual misconduct developed.

8 .

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

- The insurance carrier for the church canceled its coverage. Community Chapel's then-insurance carrier defended these two lawsuits and provided separate counsel for Pastor Barnett and Community Chapel. The insurance cancellation affected all of Community Chapel's insurance coverage, including coverage for fire and premises liability. As a result of that cancellation, Community Chapel was not insured for any allegations similar to those in the foregoing lawsuits and was not insured for loss to Community Chapel's property from fire or for accidents occurring on its property to parishioners or other visitors. Community Chapel attempted but was unable to procure insurance for any risk, including fire and premises liability.
- d. Pastor Barnett's wife separated from him, causing him much distress and anguish.

ı

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

115

212 Wetermark Tower 1109 First Avenue Seattle, Warhington 98101 (206) 467-0303

- f. Income to the church dropped requiring cutbacks in personnel and staff. In the fall of 1987, Community Chapel laid off several of its approximately 200 employees and took other steps to cut operating expenses.
- g. At least one church leader approached the Pastor to express concern and dismay at his conduct, to which the Pastor turned a deaf ear.
- h. Unsavory publicity came to public attention, reflecting upon Pastor Barnett and the church.
- 16. On December 24, Jerry Zwack, who had been cut by Hicks from his employment at the church's counselling center and Bible College, and who was felt by Pastor Barnett to harbor some ill feelings toward him growing out of these terminations, delivered to the homes of the Senior Elders, two counsellors, and several members of the Board of Elders, a letter critical of Donald Barnett and his conduct. Zwack had been a full-time employee of Community Chapel as a counsellor in its Counselling Center and as a Bible teacher in its Bible College. Zwack remained as a parishioner of Community Chapel.

1

Ż

3

5

g

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

25

26

DELETED MATERIAL FILED UNDER SEAL

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

- 19. Pastor Barnett believed that the grievances included the claim that Zwack's release from Bible College class and removal from the Counselling Center were due to actions by the Pastor.
- 20. A group of the three Senior Elders, Elders and counsellors met to decide what action they should take in response to the Zwack letter, whether or not hearings should be held, and if hearings were held, the procedures to be followed.
- 21. Included in the group was David Motherwell, Pastor Barnett's counselor, who was nominated to the group by the Pastor to assure that Pastor Barnett's position on the grievances be brought before the group. In addition to the Senior Elders, Board of Elders, and Motherwell, two other counsellors who were neither members of the Senior Elders nor the Board of Elders were added, bringing the group to 16 members. This group of 16 was referred to interchangeably as the "Elders" or the "Eldership,"

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 11

212 Watermark Tower 1109 First Avenus Scattle, Washington 98101 (206) 467-0393

· Arm who distributed by the State of the St

26

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

and will be referred to herein as the "Eldership" to distinguish it from the Board of Elders. The hearings that were later held by the Eldership were referred to as the "Elders' Hearings" or the "Eldership Hearings," and will be referred to herein by the latter title.

- Motherwell was a full-time, paid counsellor He was chosen by Pastor Barnett as his Community Chapel. personal counsellor in approximately August, 1987, and continued in that role until March 4, 1988. In August, 1987, Pastor Barnett appointed Motherwell as Director of Counselling.
- There is no provision in the Articles and Bylaws to deal with grievances against the Original Pastor, nor do they provide for any procedures to be followed for hearings. disciplining or removal of the Original Pastor. There is a procedure for removing subsequent pastors.
- The Eldership had some concern whether Donald Barnett would submit to a hearing or that he might exercise his pastoral authority to prevent it, interrupt it, or refuse to recognize the outcome of a hearing.
- Many of the Eldership were aware of the Articles and Bylaws of Community Chapel, were aware of their Protective Provisions, and that the pastor was above the church division of Community Chapel, controlled the church division of Community Chapel, and had crucial control over the other divisions of Community Chapel.

25 26

ı

2

3

5

6

7

Q

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND -CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 12 1109 First Aven (306) 467-0393

118

- 27. Some of the Eldership felt that the grievances raised by Zwack were groundless and Pastor Barnett could easily explain the facts satisfactorily, either because they had great faith and trust in Pastor Barnett or they suspected Zwack's motives and reasons. Others felt that the issues raised by Zwack were very serious.
- 28. The Eldership organized, with Elder Russell MacKenzie as moderator.
- 29. To meet some of the concerns of the group, MacKenzie prepared the Agreement, dated January 25, 1988. Because no one could be sure what information the hearings might adduce, the Agreement was made intentionally broad to cover a wide range of circumstances. The draft Agreement was presented to Pastor Barnett by his counselor, David Motherwell. Barnett was reluctant to sign it, but Motherwell persuaded him to sign, with the handwritten addition placed on it by Pastor Barnett.

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 13

ı

2

3

5

6

7

9

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24 25 26

212 Watermark Tower 1109 Firm Avenus Iranie, Weshington 90101 (206) 467-4393

- CHARLE WHILE THE STATE OF THE

- 31. This concern led Pastor Barnett and the other recipients of Zwack's letter to believe there was great importance to resolve Zwack's charges.
- 32. The January 25, 1988 Agreement is Exhibit 15, and by this reference made a part hereof as completely as if set out in full, and should be read by any reviewer.
- 33. Based on the events leading up to January, 1988, the condition of Community Chapel at that time, and conversations Pastor Barnett had with Motherwell, in signing this Agreement Pastor Barnett had to have known that his conduct was going to be scrutinized by the Eldership as part of their Hearings, and that if something was found reprehensible, the Eldership would have the power to do something about it. When he signed Exhibit 15 Pastor Barnett understood that the Eldership Hearings were not just a fact finding hearing. By agreeing to the terms of Exhibit 15, Pastor Barnett acknowledged the Eldership's authority to discipline him.
- 34. Moderator MacKenzie also prepared Guidelines to be followed at the hearing. The Guidelines are Exhibit 23 and should be read by any reviewer.

2

3

5

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

212 Westermerk Towar 1109 First Avenus Scattle, Washington 98101 (2004-067-0303

- 35. Motherwell provided Pastor Barnett with a copy of the Guidelines before commencement of the hearing. They discussed these Guidelines and Pastor Barnett agreed with them. At the start of the hearings, MacKenzie furnished a copy to each member of the Eldership and to Jerry Zwack and Donald Barnett.
- 36. Community Chapel had no existing procedure for dealing with issues such as those raised by the Zwack letter of December 23, 1987. The January 25, 1988 Agreement, the Guidelines, and the undertaking of the Eldership to hold the hearings constituted the procedures developed under these circumstances for determining and resolving the issues raised in the Zwack letter. Pastor Barnett and all others concerned treated this as a binding procedure and agreed to and participated in it.
- 37. Pastor Barnett and the Eldership understood that paragraph 7 of the Guidelines referring to "witnesses" was to include individuals such as Zwack, Motherwell, Peterson, and Hartley whose knowledge of Pastor Barnett's activities was primarily based on information from female parishioners who told them what Pastor Barnett had done and said to them. One of the reasons Pastor Barnett asked that Motherwell serve on the Eldership was so that he could give information when both Pastor Barnett and Zwack were not present.
- 38. The plan devised for the Eldership hearings and review sessions was altogether reasonable, proper, fair, and protective of all.

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

	39.	Hea	rings	began	on	January	25,	1988,	and	usually	lasted
four	to	five	hours	in th	e a	fternoon	, fi	ve day	s pe	r week.	

40. First, Zwack addressed the group, followed by Pastor Barnett. Then Zwack answered the remarks followed by Pastor Barnett. Zwack spoke for about 9 hours; Pastor Barnett between 20 and 30 hours. Both Zwack and Pastor Barnett then were given a further opportunity to respond to each other.

DELETED MATERIAL FILED UNDER SEAL

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

1109 Picst Scottle, Woolds (2006-44) DELETED MATERIAL FILED UNDER SEAL

45. Pastor Barnett was permitted abundant time to present his case to the Eldership and no request of his for additional time to present information was denied by the Eldership. Pastor Barnett and Zwack were each present during the other's statements.

DELETED MATERIAL FILED UNDER SEAL

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND : . CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 17

212 Watermerk Toner 1109 First Avenus South, Warhington 40101 (206) 467-0203

2 3 5 DELETED MATERIAL FILED UNDER SEAL 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 Pastor Barnett asked the Eldership to answer eight 17 questions relating to their authority to conduct the Hearings. 18 These questions were: 19 Who made you a judge over me? 1. 20 Does Scripture give you that right? 2. 21 3. Do the bylaws give you that right? 22 4. Did I give you that right?

What is the reason that I am being

174

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S. 110) First Avenue

is, Washington 98101 (204) 467-0393

brought to trial?

1

23

24

25 26 5.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND .

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 18-

- 6. What is the reason that I should be tried and not you? What is different in your case?
- 7. What are the specific grievances against me?
- 8. What will this lawsuit do to your respect for me?

DELETED MATERIAL FILED UNDER SEAL

- 52. Pastor Barnett's remarks were taped at his meeting with the Senior Elders and played to the meeting of the Eldership that afternoon. It was the belief of the Eldership that Pastor Barnett had violated the January 25 Agreement by attempting to use his pastoral authority to control the hearings, interfere with their final authority over the meetings, and to stop those meetings.
- 53. The Eldership meetings continued without further statements from Pastor Barnett or Zwack.
- 54. Neither Jerry Zwack nor Donald Barnett were present to hear, answer, or deny the information given during the exclusive eldership review sessions.
- 55. Zwack and Pastor Barnett were on notice that the named Elders and others had personal information concerning facts set out in the grievances (See Exhibit 22, Zwack's December 23, 1987)

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

ı

2

3

5

6 7

8 9 10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- 56. No witnesses were proposed by Pastor Barnett or Zwack.
- 57. The Eldership did not violate Guideline No. 9. Pastor Barnett consented to this procedure whereby further information was disclosed in the Eldership review sessions at which he was not present.
- 58. The guidelines did not prevent taking temporary notes.

 Once Pastor Barnett filed this action, the Eldership was justified in preserving their temporary notes until this action finally ends.
- 59. On February 10, 1988, the three Senior Elders, without the presence of or notice to Pastor Barnett, met and placed the Pastor on Special Status as an individual and collective act. See Exhibit 24.
- 60. Special Status was a form of probation with conditions placed on the person and his/her activities.
- 61. One of the uses of special status was as the first step in disfellowshipping, which banishes a person from the church.
- 62. The special status procedures and guidelines used by Community Chapel and in effect during February and March, 1988 are set forth in Exhibit 39. It was the custom and practice at Community Chapel that Elders, Senior Elders, the Pastor, and counsellors could place an individual on special status.

,

2

3

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

212 Wetermerk Tower 1109 First Avenue Scottle, Washington 98101 (206) 467-0303

23 Duration: Indefinite.

3.

4.

21

22

24

25 26 66. The terms of Pastor Barnett's special status were reasonable under the circumstances.

To confine any time spent in the company of women

Not counsel any woman alone.

not your wife to group situations.

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPERO, P.S.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 21 _ 127

212 Watermerk Tower 1109 First Avenue Seatle, Washington 98101 (306) 467-0393

The same that the control teams of the same that the same

The decision by the Senior Elders to place Pastor Barnett on special status and the Eldership's ratification was a reasonable response to the circumstances disclosed by the Eldership hearings and review sessions and events following them.

DELETED MATERIAL FILED UNDER SEAL

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 22 128

1

2

3

5

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

21 22

The second

(304) 467-0393

grandana militarik 1973 - 1992 yang menerakan disibili mengandak berakan kelangan disibili di berakan di berak

70. Because of Pastor Barnett's defiance, the Eldership determined that further action was needed to correct Pastor Barnett's conduct and reduce its potential harm to the congregation and church.

DELETED MATERIAL FILED UNDER SEAL

- 73. On February 26, 1988, pursuant to a decision by the entire Eldership, certain of the Eldership addressed the congregation at a regular worship service, in Pastor Barnett's absence, telling the audience that the Senior Elders and Eldership had placed Pastor Barnett on Special Status, and the conditions that he be required to comply with, because of the sexual misconduct to which the Pastor had admitted.
- 74. The details of that misconduct were not disclosed. They asked the congregation to pray for Pastor Barnett, and continue to love him and treat him as their pastor. The Eldership took this step and made these disclosures so that women in the congregation could protect themselves from Pastor Barnett

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 23

212 Watermark Towar 1109 First Avenue tottle, Washington 98(0) (200) 467-0393

6

3

7 8

9 10

11 12

13 14

15

16 17

18 19

20

21 22

23 24

25 26

and to protect Community Chapel from liability. The bylaws state that Pastor Barnett shall be in charge of all services of the church, whether or not he is present.

The disclosures made by the Eldership to the congregation on February 26, 1988 were limited to what was reasonably necessary to inform the congregation of the reasons why Pastor Barnett had been placed on special status and the This disclosure of facts conditions attached to that status. developed in the Eldership meeting was contrary to the specific request of Pastor Barnett to keep confidential such matters.

- Barnett addressed the return, Pastor Upon his 76. congregation on February 28, 1988, in a lengthy sermon, in which he stated that he would not follow the terms and conditions of the special status, and would not accept the authority of the Eldership. See Exhibit 31, written transcript, and Exhibit 32, tape recording of the sermon, which is so extended that it defies characterization.
- The following day, the Pastor met with the Eldership, demanding that each write a letter recanting the action taken and confessing their wickedness.
- Disfellowshipping at Community Chapel was expulsion from the church. A disfellowshipped individual could no longer attend services at Community Chapel, lost all their corporate and church positions at Community Chapel, including their job if they were an employee, and could not fellowship with any parishioners,

Company of Assert American

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

212 Watermark Tower 1109 First Avenue Scattle, Washington 98101 (206) 467-0393

2

3

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

Seath and Seath

Disfellowshipping was governed by Division 2, Section 6, Article 2 of the Bylaws. (Exhibit 10) The Bylaws and the following documents regarding disfellowshipping are part of the official documents at Community Chapel and were so treated by The Special Status Guidelines (Exhibit 39), Community Chapel: the July 30, 1987 memo from Zwack to the Counselling Center staff (Exhibit 14) and the September 25, 1987 memo from Jack Hicks to Department Heads (Exhibit 37).

The Bylaws gave Pastor Barnett the power to concur in any disfellowshipping, a power he could delegate to his designee. For some time prior to July 30, 1987, Pastor Barnett delegated this power to Hicks, at which time Pastor Barnett revoked that delegation, as set forth in Exhibit 14. As of September 25, 1987, the date of Exhibit 37, Pastor Barnett again delegated this power to concur in disfellowshippings, this time to Motherwell. Motherwell retained this power through March 4, 1988.

It was the custom and practice at Community Chapel that Senior Elders, Elders, and counsellors had and exercised the power to disfellowship. Disfellowshipping was not limited to instances where a counsellor disfellowshipped someone who was currently their counsellee. While Pastor Barnett or his designee had the right of concurrence in disfellowshippings, the actual practice in 1987 and 1988 was that significant numbers of

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND 131

212 Watermark Tower 1109 First Avenue Scattle, Washington 98101 (206) 467-0393

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 25

l

individuals were disfellowshipped without the concurrence of either Pastor Barnett or his designee, that Pastor Barnett knew this, and he did not complain of this practice at the time.

- It was also the custom and practice at Community Chapel individual could be disfellowshipped without the that an concurrence of Pastor Barnett or his designee under emergency or aggravated circumstances.
- Any individual attending Community Chapel was subject to disfellowshipping, including its Senior Elders, Elders, and pastors. Pastor Barnett was not exempted from disfellowshipping. Pastor Barnett's own words in his response to Rumor 20 contained in Balance II magazine, Trial Exhibit 27, state that he was accountable for his actions, as follows:

Chapel is Community at pastor Rumor 20: The accountable to no one.

I am accountable to the bylaws, the Reply: Untrue. even to the fellow elders, elders, senior congregation, and, most of all, to God. The senior elders watch for my ministry. They would never allow me to err substantially without requiring repentance and/or correction. I submit to them as they do to me.

Pastor Barnett acknowledged his accountability in his sermons of February 28, 1988 (Exhibits 31 and 32) and March 6, 1988 (Exhibits 40 and 41).

84. On March 3, 1988, the ten Elders of the Eldership (not counting the three Senior Elders and the three non-Elders of the voted to recommend to the Senior Elders to committee) disfellowship Donald Barnett. (Exhibit 33)

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

- On March 3, 1988, the 16 members of the Eldership voted 85. unanimously to disfellowship Donald Barnett. (Exhibit 34) As of that date, Pastor Barnett no longer held any positions with Community Chapel. Based on this finding, some of the following findings may not be necessary.
- In response to calls from Pastor Barnett's secretary, the three Senior Elders met at the parsonage with Pastor Barnett early on the morning of March 4, 1988. Pastor Barnett wanted them to come separately, but they came as a group.
- A dispute arose as to the purpose of the meeting. Pastor Barnett wanted to discuss a matter having to do with addressing the congregation. The Senior Elders wanted to discuss proposed amendments to remove the Protective Provisions from the Articles.
- One of the Senior Elders handed Pastor Barnett a copy of proposed amendments to the articles. He disregarded it. When asked how he would vote on the amendments to the Articles, Pastor The three Senior Barnett kept talking about other matters. Elders then voted unanimously to adopt the amendments to the Articles.
- At that point, Pastor Barnett abruptly terminated the meeting by telling the Senior Elders to leave his house. went to Jack Hicks' office, where they executed documents relating to amendment of the Articles. Those were immediately taken by Scott Hartley to Olympia for filing.

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 27

de tradition de la company de la company

133

1109 First Avenu attle, Washington 98101 (206) 467-0393

90. Upon Hartley's return that afternoon, the Senior Elders held a second meeting to resume their business.

91. At this afternoon meeting, the board of Senior Elders voted collectively to disfellowship Donald Barnett and separately voted to remove him from all offices. (Exhibits 48 and 49)

92. In voting on March 4, 1988 to remove Pastor Barnett from all offices and disfellowshipping him, the Senior Elders acted in their capacity as a Board of Directors. Pastor Barnett's presence was required under the Bylaws, but the Senior Elder's action was nonetheless valid without him because of the circumstances. Specifically this meeting occurred after Pastor Barnett had demanded that the Elders individually write a letter to him and the congregation disavowing their action of placing him on special status, and the very day when he told the three Senior Elders to leave the parsonage, after they sought a meeting with him. Viewed under all these facts and circumstances, the Senior Elders were not required to give notice of this meeting to Pastor Barnett.

93. The Eldership's March 4, 1988 letter and the Senior Elders' March 4, 1988 letter informing Pastor Barnett of the disfellowshippings were delivered to Pastor Barnett on that date. (Exhibits 34 and 49) Motherwell's only action to disfellowship Pastor Barnett was as a part of the vote of the 16 members of the Eldership.

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

1109 First Avenue Scattle, Waskington 98101 (206) 467-0393 94. The Eldership and the Senior Elders reasonably concluded, in light of the circumstances at the time, that exceptional or extenuating circumstances existed, justifying their decision to disfellowship Pastor Barnett without further notice to him. They also reasonably concluded that these circumstances created an emergency.

- 95. The emergency was created by Pastor Barnett with his open defiance of their attempts to control his misconduct. His availability to discuss their decisions to disfellowship him did not reduce that emergency.
- 96. Pastor Barnett was warned before the decisions to disfellowship him that such action might be taken. He admitted during his February 28, 1988 address that he received such warnings.
- 97. Pastor Barnett never requested an appeal or reconsideration of the decisions to disfellowship him. He regarded his filing of this lawsuit as the equivalent of such an appeal.
- 98. The congregation at Community Chapel never voted on a disfellowshipping decision. The decisions to disfellowship Pastor Barnett were never submitted to the congregation for a vote.
- 99. The Eldership and the three Senior Elders reasonably concluded, based on the information adduced at their hearings,

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

212 Watermark Tower 1109 First Avenue Seattle, Washington 98101 (206) 467-0393

that Pastor Barnett had materially breached the terms of his employment contract with Community Chapel.

100. Based on the information adduced at their hearings and Pastor Barnett's defiance of their curative efforts, the Eldership and the three Senior Elders reasonably believed that Pastor Barnett had breached his fiduciary duties to Community Chapel and its congregants, that those breaches were likely to recur, and that they had just cause to remove and disfellowship him.

- 101. In deciding to disfellowship Pastor Barnett, the Eldership and the board of Senior Elders acted in good faith.
- 102. In deciding to remove Pastor Barnett from all corporate offices, the Senior Elders acted in good faith.
- 103. Under date of April 8, 1988, Amended Articles of Faith and Bylaws were executed by naming Donald Barnett as the Original Pastor, President of the Corporation, Chairman and ex-officio member of the Board of Directors of Community Chapel and Bible Training School. (Exhibit 11)
- 104. This revision was pursuant to action of the Board of Directors taken in December 1987. (Exhibit 26)
- 105. The purpose of the revision was solely to sever the satellite churches, not to reinstate any directors or officers, including Pastor Barnett. The revision spoke as of December 1987; not April 1988. It was not intended and did not have the effect of reinstating anyone.

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 30

212 Watermark Tower 1109 First Avenue Seattle, Washington 98101 (206) 467-0393

106. The Senior Elders now serving are bona fide acting Senior Elders and are authorized to continue to defend this action and to prosecute defendants' counterclaim on behalf of all defendants.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

Jurisdiction

- 1. This Court has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of this action.
- 2. The issues raised by this action are capable of resolution without resort to or entanglement in religious doctrinal issues. This Court is not required to and does not choose to abstain from deciding the secular issues raised by this action.

Eldership Hearings

- 3. The Eldership established a procedure accepted by Pastor Barnett for resolving the complaints against the pastor. This procedure included the Agreement dated January 25, 1988 and the Guidelines prepared by Moderator Russell McKenzie. By its terms, this procedure included an agreement by Pastor Barnett not to exercise any authority over the hearings and to permit them to continue until they were concluded to the satisfaction of the Eldership.
- 4. This procedure vested in the Eldership the authority to hear all matters concerning the issues raised by the grievances against Pastor Barnett and to take such action as the facts

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 31

212 Watermark Tower 1109 First Avenue Scattle, Washington 98101 (206) 467-0393

- 6. The Eldership received substantial evidence, reasonably believed by them to be true, that was sufficient and appropriate to take action to disfellowship Pastor Barnett.
- 7. The Eldership and Senior Elders had fair and honest reasons for their actions. They acted in good faith, and not for arbitrary, capricious, or illegal reasons.

Disfellowshipping

- 8. No one at Community Chapel was immune from disfellowshipping. The Protective Provisions in the Bylaws did not apply to disfellowshipping and did not preclude Pastor Barnett from being disfellowshipped.
- 9. Each of the 16 members of the Eldership had authority to disfellowship.
- 10. The 16 members of the Eldership properly disfellowshipped Pastor Barnett, removing him from the church.
- 11. The Elders, as distinguished from the Eldership, recommended to the Senior Elders that they take action to disfellowship Pastor Barnett.
- 12. The Senior Elders had the authority and power to disfellowship Pastor Barnett.

138

26

25

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.
212 Watermark Tower

1109 First Avenue

Scattle, Washington 98101

(206) 467-0393

The Eldership and Senior Elders faced emergency or aggravated circumstances, which gave them further authority to disfellowship Pastor Barnett without his presence or concurrence.

Pastor Barnett no longer had the right to require his own concurrence in the decision to disfellowship him.

Breach of Contract

- The Articles and Bylaws created an employment contract 16. between Pastor Barnett and Community Chapel. The Protective Provisions had the effect of assuring Pastor Barnett lifetime employment, at his option, so long as he performed the obligations of that contract. These provisions prevented his removal at will.
- 17. Pastor Barnett had an obligation under this contract to perform the duties of his office in good faith, to carry out faithfully the duties and obligations of a pastor and minister, not to engage in conduct that would violate the Bylaws, and to abide by his fiduciary duties to Community Chapel and its congregation.
- Based on substantial evidence, the Senior Elders and 18. Eldership reasonably concluded that Pastor Barnett materially breached each of these obligations. Each of these breaches found by the Senior Elders and Eldership, standing alone,

25

l

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

26

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

139

217 Watermark Tower 1109 First Avenue Seattle, Washington 98101 (206) 467-0393

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 33

the interests of the corporation.

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

140

Chapel not to use his position for personal purposes inimical to

FINDINGS OF FACT AND

212 Watermark Tower 1109 First Avenue Scattle, Washington 98101 (206) 467-0393

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 34

23

24

25

26

- 25. Given his special position and the considerable powers he enjoyed, Pastor Barnett had a fiduciary duty to respect the trust and confidence placed in him by Community Chapel congregants, and to avoid using his position and powers to exploit congregants for his personal advantage.
- 26. The Eldership reasonably concluded that Pastor Barnett flagrantly breached these fiduciary duties by using his position and powers to take repeated sexual advantage of women congregants and to intimidate them into silence.
- 27. Due to his breach of fiduciary duty, Pastor Barnett was not entitled to invoke the Protective Provisions in the Articles and Bylaws to prevent his removal.
- 28. By disfellowshipping Pastor Barnett, the Eldership properly exercised its inherent authority to remove Pastor Barnett for his breach of fiduciary duty.
- 29. By disfellowshipping Pastor Barnett and separately voting to remove him from all offices, the Senior Elders properly exercised their inherent authority to remove Pastor Barnett for his breach of fiduciary duty.
- 30. These decisions by the Eldership and Senior Elders were supported by substantial evidence reasonably believed by them to be true, and were taken in good faith and not for arbitrary or capricious reasons.

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 35

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

212 Watermark Tower 1109 First Avenue Scattle, Washington 98101 (206) 467-0393

April 1988 Amendments

31. The April 1988 amendments to the Bylaws did not reinstate Pastor Barnett.

Successor Senior Elders

32. Pastor Barnett is not entitled in this action to challenge the authority of the present Senior Elders to hold office or their authority or standing to maintain this action on behalf of all defendants.

DATED this // day of April, 1991.

Judge Walter Deierlein, Retired Arbitrator

12

13

14

ı

2

3

4

5

7

8

9

10

11

Presented by:

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

15 16

> Robert J. Rohah WSBA #7744

17 18

19

Copy Received; Notice of Presentaation Waived; Approved as to Form:

20

EDWARDS, SIEH, WIGGINS & HATHAWAY

The warming of the state of the

21

22

Charles Wiggins

23

WSBA #6948 Attorneys for Plaintiff

25

24

26

ROHAN, GOLDFARB & SHAPIRO, P.S.

142

212 Watermark Tower 1109 First Avenue Scattle, Washington 98101 (206) 467-0393

FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 36

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW - 37